

[DO NOT PUBLISH]

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE ELEVENTH CIRCUIT

---

No. 15-12340

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

BEVERLY JONES,  
STEVE JONES,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

PROCTER AND GAMBLE COMPANY,  
PROCTER AND GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC, THE,  
PROCTER AND GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY, THE,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12391

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In re: DENTURE CREAM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION.

---

DONALD KIMBALL,  
JAMES R. WILKERSON,  
MARIE WILKERSON,  
BOBBY COCKRILL,  
BETTY COCKRILL,  
DENICE SEDLACEK,  
MICHAEL SEDLACEK,  
WILLIAM M. KEITH,  
Individually and as Executor de son  
Tort of The Estate of Linda Sakcriska,  
CORBITT CARTER,  
OPAL CARTER,  
DEBORAH G. JONES,  
ALAN J. JONES,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12393

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

MRS. CHRISTY HARDING,  
MR. DAVID HARDING, her husband,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12419

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

RAYMOND ENGLISH,  
THERESA ENGLISH,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12420

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ELLENIE STEELE,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12421

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

DOROTHY GIBSON,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12422

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ANNE M. COFFMAN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12424

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

PEGGY ANN SMITH-LLOYD,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12427

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

FAYE G. HOBSON,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12433

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

BARBARA SUE MENDENHALL,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12434

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ROBERT DONALD LANE,  
SHARON GAY LANE, as the Administrator for the Estate of Robert Donald  
Lane,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12436

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JENNIFER J. CORNETT,  
ROBERT L. CORNETT,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12437

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ROBIN ANN EVANS,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12449

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

RHONDA JOLENE SHUMATE,  
BRIAN SHUMATE,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12450

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

PAUL CAMPIONE,  
MAE CAMPIONE,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12451

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ANGELA COUCH,  
BARRY COUCH, Individually and as Administrator of the Estate of Angela  
Couch,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12456

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JUDY SIMPSON SAMMONS,  
ROBERT TURNER SAMMONS,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12457

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

DORA ANNETTE ROWLEN,

Plaintiff,

CARLTON ROWLEN,

Administrator of the Estate of Dora A. Rowlen,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12462

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

CYNTHIA A. WILLIAMS,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12465

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JAMES BYLES,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12467

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

DAVID HOFFMAN,

CAROL M. HOFFMAN,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12470

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

DIANE DE HAVEN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12471

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

BRIAN L. STEINE,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12473

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JUDITH SULLIVAN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12475

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

LEE RUSSO,  
ANDREW RUSSO,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12476

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

HERSHEL BIFFLE,

Plaintiff,

FELECIA BIFFLE, individually and as Administratrix of the Estate of Hershel Biffle,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12477

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

KATHERINE B. MEHROFF,

Plaintiff,

DAVID L. MEHRHOFF,  
Individually and as Executor  
of the Estate of Katherine Mehrhoff,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

No. 15-12478

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

MELISSA J. BABB,  
THOMAS R. BABB,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12480

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

MISTY DAWN JORDAN,

Plaintiff,

JOHNNY R. ELLZY,  
as the Administrator of the Estate of  
Misty Dawn Jordan,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12481

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

SHAWN RENAY RANKIN,  
MAX RANKIN,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. GlaxoSmithKline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12484

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JOYCE LUNNE HARRELL,  
RICK A. HARRELL,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12485

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

HEIDI SUE WEBER, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

STEPHANIE FUS,  
as the Administratrix of the Estate of  
Heidi Sue Weber,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12486

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

TENA R. THORN,

Plaintiff,

BRENT TYLER URBAN,  
individually and as Administrator of the Estate  
of Tena R. Thorn, deceased,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12490

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

MARY LOU SMITH-BROXTON,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12491

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

CHRISTINA BALLMAN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12492

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

SHARI BAKER GARRISON,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12493

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

WILLIAM R. WILLIS,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12494

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ANN CLAIR,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12495

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JANICE LYNN KERR,  
HARVEL KERR,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12499

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

PETER MICHAEL BASSIN,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12500

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

ANNA JANE BAKER,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12501

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

GENE GOSNELL,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12502

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

PEGGY L. SINGLETON,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12503

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

JAMES L. ATKINSON,  
TANA S. ATKINSON,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12504

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

DORETHA GILES,

Plaintiff - Appellant,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 15-12505

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

In Re: Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation.

---

EFRAIN RODRIGUEZ,  
IRENE FELIZ SEGURA,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

SMITHKLINE BEECHAM CORPORATION,  
d.b.a. Glaxosmithkline, et al.,

Defendants,

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING, LLC,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

No. 16-10130

---

D.C. Docket No. 1:09-md-02051-CMA

BENJAMIN BERMAN,  
CHRISTOPHER D. BIRD, SR.,  
JOSEPH DAVIS, III,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

versus

THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE MANUFACTURING CO.,  
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE DISTRIBUTING LLC,

Defendants - Appellees.

---

Appeals from the United States District Court  
for the Southern District of Florida

---

(June 15, 2016)

Before WILSON and JULIE CARNES, Circuit Judges, and WOOD,\* District Judge.

PER CURIAM:

This appeal consolidates forty-eight individual appeals arising out of multidistrict litigation in *In re Denture Cream Products Liability Litigation*, 1:09-md-02051-CMA. In their complaints, Plaintiffs alleged that Defendants produced

---

\* Honorable Lisa Godbey Wood, United States District Chief Judge for Southern District of Georgia, sitting by designation.

a denture cream that caused Plaintiffs to develop a condition known as copper deficiency myelopathy.

In 2015, the district court issued an order granting Defendants' *Daubert*<sup>1</sup> motion to exclude all or part of the testimony of Plaintiffs' general causation expert witnesses. The parties stipulated that this order was case-dispositive, meaning that without the ability to prove general causation, Plaintiffs could not prevail. Given that stipulation, the district court issued orders dismissing the Plaintiffs' cases with prejudice. In its orders of dismissal, the court referenced the 2015 *Daubert* order, as well as a 2013 order precluding testimony by any treating physicians of Plaintiffs who had not produced Rule 26(a)(2)(B) reports.

Plaintiffs now appeal these orders of dismissal and, more particularly, the *Daubert* and Rule 26(a)(2)(B) orders identified above. After carefully reviewing the parties' briefs and the record, and with the benefit of oral argument, we find no reversible error in either of the district court's orders.

**AFFIRMED.**

---

<sup>1</sup> *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993).